In 2011, Arizona’s community colleges embarked upon a long-term Strategic Vision to significantly increase the number of Arizonans who achieve their postsecondary education and training goals, complete a degree or certificate, and/or transfer to a university. In order to measure progress toward the three major goals outlined in the Strategic Vision, the colleges have implemented a rigorous self-assessment and accountability process centered around the annual collection and distribution of data related to 30 key indicators.

Data presented in the 2015 Strategic Vision Student Progress and Outcomes Report identify areas of strength, as well as places where Coconino Community College (CCC) will need to focus its efforts in order to improve student access, retention, and completion. For some of the retention and completion measures, a specific group of students called the “Credential-Seeking Cohort” was tracked; this group is defined as full- and part-time learners who earned at least 12 credit hours by the end of their second year. Tracking this sub-cohort aligns CCC’s data collection and accountability strategies with those of national community college initiatives such as the Voluntary Framework of Accountability (VFA). Furthermore, analysis of retention and completion outcomes within this sub-cohort provides a more accurate gauge of community college student success, as it takes into account learners’ diverse educational and training goals.

The 2015 outcomes presented in this report can be compared to those from previous years, and trends in student progress and outcomes are starting to emerge. However, many external forces (such as the state of Arizona’s economy, the actions of other public institutions of higher education, and the availability of funding for community colleges) also affect these trends, making long-term projections difficult at best.

HIGHLIGHTS OF CCC’S 2015 STUDENT PROGRESS AND OUTCOMES REPORT

Access

• Coconino Community College students successfully transition from developmental to college-level English courses at a rate substantially higher than the statewide average (66%, compared to 50%).

Retention

• At 64% and 77%, respectively, CCC’s developmental and college-level course success rates are higher than statewide averages.

Completion

• CCC has doubled its graduation rate from 10% to 20% over the past four years.
• 97% of CCC’s 2012-13 occupational program completers/leavers earned an industry-recognized credential within one year of exiting the college.
• Three out of four learners in CCC’s 2008 Credential-Seeking Cohort achieved a successful outcome within 6 years.
ARIZONA COMMUNITY COLLEGES: LONG-TERM STRATEGIC VISION

In 2011 Arizona’s community colleges published a long-term strategic plan, which has since been incorporated into strategic planning processes at community colleges across the state. This plan outlined a clear vision for Arizona’s ten community college districts and identified 30 key indicators of progress toward 3 major goal areas: access, retention, and completion. Many of these indicators are aligned with those included in the American Association for Community Colleges’ Voluntary Framework of Accountability (VFA) initiative, which will allow for comparisons with national norms in years to come.

A major function of the Strategic Vision is the collection, analysis, and publication of data pertaining to the 30 key indicators of progress, as well as the sharing of best practices and successful program models across the state. This document is the fourth in a series of annual reports providing data related to student progress and outcomes at Coconino Community College (CCC). Where available, comparable national data are also shown.

As 2015 represents the fourth full year of Strategic Vision data collection, the outcomes presented in this document can be compared to those from previous years, and trends in student progress and outcomes are starting to emerge. These trends will enable Coconino Community College to set reasonable benchmarks for attainment related to core metrics.

However, many external forces (such as the state of Arizona’s economy, the actions of other public institutions of higher education, and the availability of funding for community colleges) also affect these trends, making longer-term projections difficult at best.

The Strategic Vision, as well as a Technical Guide that provides detailed definitions of each key indicator of progress, can be found online at: www.arizonacommunitycolleges.org.

OUR VISION: Arizona’s community colleges, through a collaborative effort with education, business, and community partners, will significantly increase the number of Arizonans who achieve their postsecondary education and training goals, complete a degree or certificate, and/or transfer to a university.
ACCESS INDICATORS

Indicator 1. Full-Time Student Equivalent (FTSE) Enrollment

Following the statewide trend, annual full-time student equivalent (FTSE) enrollment at CCC has declined slightly from its high of 2,399 in 2010-11. These enrollment numbers likely reflect a greater number of students enrolling directly in the state’s universities and/or private institutions, as well as an improved economy drawing more students into the workplace.

Indicator 2. Enrollment of Underserved Populations

In 2013-14, 35% of CCC students were members of an underserved racial or ethnic group; 27% were Pell recipients, and 33% were over the age of 24.

The percentage of CCC’s student body that is an underserved minority (35%) is somewhat lower than the proportion of American Indians, African Americans, Latinos, and Pacific Islanders in Coconino County (43%).

Indicator 3. Percent of Student Credit Hours Earned via Alternative Delivery Methods and/or at Alternative Times and Places

At CCC, only 51% of instruction in 2013-14 occurred in traditional semester-length classes held on campus, Monday through Friday, between the hours of 8am and 5pm.

Extending access to many diverse populations, 49% of all student credit hours were earned online, at night or on the weekends, in short-term or open-entry/open-exit courses, and in skills centers, American Indian reservations, Army bases, or prisons.

---

ACCESS INDICATORS

Indicators 4-5. Community College-Going Rate and Overall College-Going Rate

In 2013-14, CCC enrolled 18% of all recent high school graduates from the college’s service area. This rate is double the rate four years prior.

Although not shown on the graph, Arizona’s community colleges and universities together enroll 58% of all recent high school graduates.²

Indicators 6-7. Success after Remediation

After six years, 66% of all developmental English or reading learners in CCC’s 2008 New Student Cohort completed a college-level English course and 31% of developmental math learners in the same cohort successfully completed a college-level math course.

Although CCC’s success after developmental English/reading rate has increased in recent years and is now substantially higher than the statewide average (50%), the college’s success after developmental math rate dipped in the most recent year.

Indicator 8. Cost of Attendance as a Percentage of the Median Household Income in Coconino County

At just over $9,000 per year, the net price of attending CCC is just 18% of the median household income in Coconino County, making the institution an excellent and affordable option for postsecondary education and training.

CCC’s net price is reported by the National Center for Education Statistics and is based on new full-time students.

Indicators 9-10. Course Success Rates

Over two years, 77% of student credit hours attempted in college-level courses by CCC’s 2012 New Student Cohort were successfully completed (with a grade of A, B, C, or Pass).

In that same time period, 64% of student credit hours attempted in developmental courses by CCC’s 2012 New Student Cohort were successfully completed (with a grade of A, B, C, or Pass).

Both CCC’s developmental course and college-level course success rates slightly exceed statewide averages.

Indicator 11. Percent of Gateway (First College-Level) Math and English Credit Hours Successfully Completed

In 2013-14, between 72% and 88% of student credit hours attempted English Composition I, II, and Speech were successfully completed (with a grade of A, B, C, or Pass).

Although these rates have declined slightly, they meet or exceed statewide averages.
**RETENTION INDICATORS**

**Indicator 12. Percent of Full-Time Learners Completing 42 Credits and Percent of Part-Time Learners Completing 24 Credits within Two Years**

By the end of their second year, 60% of part-time learners in CCC’s 2012 Credential-Seeking Cohort had completed 24 credits, and 43% of full-time learners in the same cohort had completed 42 credits. These rates are similar to statewide averages.

Although there is room for improvement, these rates are notable, as research has linked attainment of credit thresholds (roughly equivalent to 20 credits per year for full-time students) to higher retention and completion rates.³ Further, CCC’s rate of part-time learners who have completed 24 credits in two years is notable at 60%, 17% above the state average.

**Indicators 13-14. Retention Rates**

Ninety-two percent of learners in CCC’s 2012 Credential-Seeking Cohort (excluding those who successfully transferred and/or earned a degree or certificate) persisted at their college to spring 2013, and 66% of them returned for classes the following fall.

While CCC’s fall-to-spring retention rate is similar to the statewide average, its fall-to-fall retention rate lags behind the statewide number. Nonetheless, it is substantially higher than the 53% fall-to-fall retention rate reported as a national comparison,⁴ as the national number is not limited to credential-seekers. However, national community college accountability initiatives such as the Voluntary Framework of Accountability are beginning to track and analyze retention among credential-seeking sub-cohorts, and thus more accurate national comparisons should be available in future years.


Indicator 15. Percent of Learners Achieving their Stated Education or Training Goals

This indicator is in development. It will be incorporated into the Strategic Vision once enough time has passed to link intent to completion data.

Indicator 16. Number of Degrees and Certificates Awarded

Between 2010-11 and 2013-14, the number of degrees and certificates awarded by CCC has remained relatively stable, reaching 287 in the latter year.

Of the 2013-14 total, 93% were degrees and 7% certificates. CCC is making a concerted effort to increase the number of learners earning postsecondary credentials, especially in high-demand fields.

Indicator 17. Degree/Certificate Completion Rate (Graduation Rate)

After six years, 20% of CCC’s 2008 Credential-Seeking Cohort had completed a degree or certificate. This rate is double that for the 2005 Cohort.

 Nonetheless, CCC’s graduation rate is somewhat lower than the both the statewide average of 32%, and the 23% reported as a national comparison, although the national number is not limited to credential-seekers. Nonetheless, the Voluntary Framework of Accountability is beginning to track and analyze completion among credential-seeking subcohorts, and thus more accurate national comparisons should be available in future years.
**COMPLETION INDICATORS**

**Indicator 18. AGEC Completion Rate**

Sixteen percent of CCC’s 2008 Credential-Seeking Cohort completed the Arizona General Education Curriculum (AGEC) within 6 years. This rate has increased by 60% over the last four years.

Increasing AGEC completion rates—a key priority for all of Arizona’s community colleges—will not only ease transfer to Arizona’s public universities but should help to improve bachelor’s degree completion in the state.

**Indicators 19-20. Number of In-State University Transfers, and Percent with an AGEC and/or Degree at Time of Transfer**

Between 2009-10 and 2013-14, the number of students transferring from CCC to an in-state, public university increased by 31%. Over half of transfers in each of the three most recent years had earned an AGEC and/or degree prior to transferring, a sign that the transfer process is becoming more efficient and cost effective for both students and the state.

**Indicators 21-22. In-State and Overall Transfer Rates**

CCC’s transfer rate among ASSIST Transfer Behavior Cohorts fell to 29% for the most recent cohort. However, the overall transfer rate (the percent of learners in Credential-Seeking Cohorts who transferred to any four-year college or university within 6 years) has remained somewhat stable at 35%. Both rates are higher than the most recent national transfer rate (25%) calculated by the Center for the Study of Community Colleges.⁶

---

⁶Center for the Study of Community Colleges. (2002). *National transfer rates are up! Results of the 2001 Transfer Assembly Project.* Los Angeles: Author.
Indicator 23. Percent of Learners Achieving a Successful Community College Outcome

Three out of four learners in CCC’s 2008 Credential-Seeking Cohort achieved a successful outcome within 6 years; nearly half of these transferred to another two- or four-year college or university.

Because community college learners enter college with diverse education and training goals, and because they often attend part-time and/or earn credits from more than one community college, the VFA and other national accountability initiatives have broadened the definition of a successful community college outcome to include: earning a degree or certificate; transferring to another two- or four-year college or university; continued enrollment; and/or leaving the institution after earning 30 or more credits.

Indicator 24. Percent of Full-Time Transfers to Arizona Public Universities who Earn a Bachelor’s Degree within Four Years

Sixty-three percent of all 2010-11 full-time transfers from Coconino Community College to in-state universities earned a bachelor’s degree within four years. While lower than the statewide average (68%), this rate indicates that most full-time transfers from CCC are graduating from the state’s public universities in a timely manner.

Indicator 25. Percent of all Transfers who Earn a Bachelor’s Degree within Four Years

Fifty-one percent of 2010-11 transfers from CCC to all four-year institutions—public and private, in-state and out—earned a bachelor’s degree within four years. This rate is higher than the statewide average (43%) but somewhat lower than the national average (60%) and may reflect a high incidence of part-time attendance after transfer.

Indicator 26. Percent of Occupational Program Completers/Leavers Earning an Industry-Recognized Credential within One Year

Out of all learners in CCC’s 2011-12 Occupational Completers/Leavers Cohort who took a technical skill or end-of-program assessment aligned with industry-recognized standards up to one year after college exit, 97% passed the assessment and/or earned an industry-recognized credential. This level of performance exceeds the 2011-12 national average of 83%,\(^8\) as well as the statewide average of 92%.

Examples of occupational programs leading to industry-recognized credentials include, among others, aviation technology, building and construction, dental hygiene, education, emergency medical technician, fashion, fire science, nursing, solar technologies, and veterinary technologies.

Indicator 27. Wage Growth of Occupational Completers

This indicator will be incorporated into the Strategic Vision pending a statewide agreement for sharing wage data.

Indicator 28. Percent of Adult Basic Education (ABE) and General Educational Development (GED) Learners Entering Employment

In 2013-14, three-quarters of CCC’s ABE/GED learners who were not employed at the time of entry—and who were surveyed by the National Reporting System for Adult Education (NRS)—entered employment within three months of exiting the program.

Although this rate has been variable over time, CCC’s ABE/GED learners have consistently performed higher than the national average (57%),\(^9\) indicating that Coconino Community College is effectively moving ABE/GED learners into the workforce.

---


Indicator 29. Adult Basic Education (ABE) and General Educational Development (GED) Learner Outcomes

In 2013-14, 80% of CCC’s ABE/GED completers who held a GED or high school diploma subsequently enrolled in further education within one year of program exit. This number is substantially higher than the national average (65%)\(^9\) as well as the statewide average (32%). Nonetheless, this rate has declined in recent years, which may be a result of low NRS survey response rates and/or an indication that more ABE/GED students are choosing to enter the job market instead of higher education.

Indicator 30. Percent of Adults with Postsecondary Experience and/or Degrees

Thirty-four percent of Coconino County adults age 25 and older have attended some college and/or have earned an associate degree. This rate is the same as the statewide average and is substantially higher than the national number (29%).\(^9\)

Moreover, 31% of adults in Coconino County hold a bachelor’s or higher degree. This rate is higher than both statewide (27%) and national (29%) averages. By continuing to provide education leading to transfer and bachelor’s degrees, and by partnering with the state’s public universities, CCC and other community colleges across the state will endeavor to help the Arizona Board of Regents reach their goal of raising the percentage of Arizona adults holding a bachelor’s degree to 28% by 2017.