

**COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD**

SPECIAL MEETING

APRIL 30, 2024



**COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE
MINUTES OF A SPECIAL MEETING
OF THE
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD
APRIL 30, 2024**

A Special Meeting of the Coconino Community College District Governing Board was held on Zoom and in the Board Room at Coconino Community College, 2800 S. Lone Tree Rd., Flagstaff, AZ 86005. Board Chair Joey Smith called the meeting to order at 2:03 pm.

PRESENT: Eric Eikenberry
Patrick Hurley
Joseph R. Smith
Nat White
Patricia Garcia

Also Present: Dr. Eric Heiser, Ms. Kirsten Mead, Dr. Jami Van Ess, Mr. Tony Williams, Ms. Dianna Sanchez, Ms. Janel States, Dr. Adriana Flores Church, Mr. Brett Kitch, Ms. Kathryn Kozak, Mr. Alejandro Higuera, Ms. Alexis Knapp Polley, Ms. Alimah Damgaard, Ms. Alycia Russo, Ms. Alyssa Sergent, Ms. Amanda Gonzalez, Ms. Amelinda Webb, Mr. Brian Wilson, Mr. Bryant Long, Ms. Buffy Shirley, Ms. Cindy Scott, Ms. Colleen Carscallen, Ms. Constance Fletcher, Mr. Craig Darr, Mr. Craig Hunt, Mr. Daniel Vigil, Ms. Daniela Tirado Barva, Mr. David Manning, Mr. David Ramos, Mr. David Summer, Mr. Doug Friedman, Mr. Edward Hernandez, Mr. Evan Burris, Mr. George West, Ms. Helena Babiski, Mr. Henry Garcia, Mr. Jarret Stoll, Ms. Jennifer Jameson, Ms. Jessica Baglione, Ms. Jessica Dodson, Ms. Julia Hull, Ms. Kathryn Kozak, Ms. Kay Leum, Mr. Keith Becker, Mr. Kurt Stull, Mr. Kyle Hessel, Mr. Lance Roberts, Mr. Larry Masayesva, Mr. Lawrence Rodriguez, Ms. Lina Wallen, Ms. Linda Neff, Ms. Lisa Hill, Mr. Luke Owens, Ms. Magi VanCleave, Mr. Brad Conway, Ms. Melissa Klemp, Ms. Michele Metcalf, Ms. Monica Foos, Mr. Nathan Tacheene, Mr. Nolan Begaye, Ms. Randi Axler, Ms. Renn Jenney, Ms. Robin Long, Ms. Rosalee Jones, Mr. Rusty Tweed, Mr. Ryan Norton, Ms. Samantha Hipolito, Mr. Shane Pablo, Mr. Shawn McGee, Ms. Stacie Avelar, Mr. Urvin Yazzie, Mr. Van Walker, Mr. Brad Conway, Mr. Jacob Christner, Mr. Ryan Hughes, Ms. Anna Hamerle, Mr. Ryan Bouwhuis

Also Present on Zoom: Mr. Brian Herliy, Mr. Carlo Dacumos, Dr. Mark Maciha, Mr. Jeff Jones, Ms. Jessica Burke, Ms. Kim Shaw, Ms. Kris Harris, Mr. Robert Miller, Ms. Rosey Rodriguez, Ms. Sandie Dihlmann, Ms. Sarah Rencher, Ms. Bess Goh, Ms. Anna Kelly, Ms. Gio Macry, Ms. Mary Norton, Ms. Abigail Kessler, Ms. Franchelle Tohannie, Mr. Dave Manning, Ms. Alexis Knapp-Polley, Ms. Cynthia Anderson, Ms. Cynthia Lee, Dr. David Borofsky, Mr. Rick McDonald, Ms. Charmayne Tsosie, Ms. Jane Jarboe, Ms. Jennifer Ureta, Ms. Jessica Laessig, Mr. Joel Fritzler, Ms. Julie Baumgartner, Ms. Katherine Costa, Ms. Patricia Petelin, Mr. Robert Ramirez, Ms. Rosa Mendoza-Logan, Ms. Scout Winfrey, Mr. Barry Carpenter, Mr. Duane Marshall, and several anonymous guests.

Reports, summaries, background material, and other documents referred to in these minutes can be found in the April 30, 2024, documents file.

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to approve the agenda, and Ms. Patricia Garcia seconded the motion. The agenda was approved as presented (Mr. Eikenberry, Mr. Hurley, Mr. Smith, and Dr. White voting in favor).

INTRODUCTION OF GUESTS

Ms. Janel States introduced Dr. David Borofsky, Executive Director of the Arizona Association of Community College Trustees, and Mr. Keith Myers, Senior Vice President of Campus Works, Inc.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

The public comments received during the Call to the Public revealed a sense of disappointment and apprehension regarding the possible outsourcing of IT services at the College. Both employees and students voiced frustration over the perceived lack of notice and transparency in the decision-making process, casting doubt on the rationale behind considering external alternatives. There were concerns about the ethical implications and potential negative impacts on the College's community values expressed. Additionally, former employees and community members shared reservations about using an outside corporation, suggesting that outsourcing IT services could have implications for the College's integrity, financial sustainability, and sense of community.

The following made comments to the Board: Henry Garcia, Keith Becker, Joshua Hudlow, Daniel Vigil, Ashley (student), Kate Kozak, Lisa Daskocil, Landon (student), Alyssa Sergeant, Helena Babiski, Alex Purchase, Joel (student), Connie Fletcher, Bob Norton, Daniella Tirado Braun, Brian Francis, Dillon (student), Evan Burris, Jennifer Jameson, Justin (student), Sheila Tomjack, Rick McDonald, Julie Baumgartner, Kim Shaw, Jeff (no last name), and Stacy Fobar.

Chair Joey Smith thanked the public for their comments and moved to review the action item.

Dr. Eric Heiser began by expressing gratitude to all who attended the meeting, both in person and via Zoom, highlighting it as a demonstration of democracy in action. He commended each individual for their respectful participation and emphasized the importance of reconsidering the proposed action item. Acknowledging the inevitability of change, he urged those claiming openness to it to ensure that any changes align with the best interests of the College and its community. Dr. Heiser appealed to the Board to withdraw the action item from the meeting's agenda, advocating for internal review to prevent undue impact on employees' lives. While recognizing the need for progress, he underscored that the proposed action may not be the right course for the College, its community, and its students now.

Chair Smith asked the trustees for their comments:

Mr. Eric Eikenberry thanked the audience and supported Dr. Heiser's recommendation.

Mr. Patrick Hurley extended gratitude to those who contributed to the discussion. He urged everyone not to underestimate the Board's dedication, pointing out that deliberations on this matter date back to 2008, marked by significant restructuring efforts within the IT department. Highlighting the less-than-favorable findings of the Tech Assessment, he stressed the Board's persistent request for data, which, to date, has not been adequately provided by the IT department for informed decision-making. Emphasizing the necessity for transformation within the IT department, he acknowledged the proposal's perceived oversight in considering its direct and indirect impacts. However, he countered by raising questions about the department's capacity to address the College's evolving needs compared to

potential external solutions. He reassured that the financial benefits would largely remain within the community, benefiting local employees. Mr. Hurley underscored that the decision-making process prioritizes the College's long-term needs over immediate gratification, aligning with the Board's longstanding calls for change.

Dr. Nat White addressed concerns by emphasizing that questioning CCC's integrity over this decision is unwarranted. He urged against prematurely dismissing CCC for grappling with a challenging choice, emphasizing that the decision was carefully considered. While acknowledging the significance of IT services, he stressed the urgent need to prioritize readiness for emerging challenges like AI and cybersecurity, which even major institutions struggle with. Themes he noted included the importance of exploring all options, such as enhancing current services or seeking additional opinions, and concerns about the implications of outsourcing. Dr. White underscored the importance of distinguishing between genuine concerns and personal opinions, as well as acknowledging the efforts of President Heiser in navigating these complex issues without letting ego interfere.

Ms. Patricia Garcia conveyed empathy for the board members, stressing their voluntary dedication to the community and expressing disappointment at any suggestion of apathy. She acknowledged the inevitability of difficult decisions and urged the audience to stand by the board through both challenges and triumphs. She emphasized the critical need to address IT concerns and highlighted potential cybersecurity risks such as ransomware and identity theft. Additionally, she requested an executive session for confidential discussions on legal and personnel matters related to the issue in the next meeting of the Board.

Chair Smith supported Dr. Heiser's decision to withdraw the agenda item, affirming that the Board has duly listened to the concerns raised. Acknowledging the crucial need for IT transformation, Chair Smith expressed deep appreciation for the consistent support provided by the IT department. However, he emphasized the distinction between daily operations and broader strategic considerations. Reflecting on over a year of Board discussions, he said there is a clear need for enhanced support and resources in IT. He commended Dr. Heiser for his proactive action, asserting that the Board's continues to have trust in his leadership.

Chair Smith called for a motion to adjourn the Meeting. Mr. Eikenberry moved to adjourn the meeting, and Dr. White seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved (Mr. Eikenberry, Mr. Hurley, Mr. Smith, and Dr. White voting in favor).

The meeting was adjourned at 3:14 pm.

ACTION ITEMS

A. Consideration of a contract to partner with CampusWorks Inc., to provide managed IT services to CCC – Dr. Eric Heiser

This action item was pulled at Dr. Eric Heiser's request, with the board's full support. IT services solutions will continue to be discussed to find a suitable solution for all parties.

MINUTES PREPARED BY:

Ms. Kirsten Mead
Board Recorder

ATTEST and APPROVED:

Mr. Patrick Hurley
Vice Chair/Secretary of the Board

Mr. Joey Smith
Board Chair