

**COCONINO COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD**

REGULAR MEETING

FEBRUARY 25, 2014



**COCONINO COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE
MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING
OF THE
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD
FEBRUARY 25, 2014**

A Regular Meeting of the Coconino County Community College District Governing Board was held at the Lone Tree campus in the Board Room at 2800 S. Lone Tree Road, Flagstaff, Arizona. Board Chair, Mr. Patrick Hurley, called the meeting to order at 5:48 p.m. The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Ms. Gioia Goodrum.

PRESENT: Patrick Hurley
Patricia Garcia
Gioia Goodrum
Lloyd Hammonds
Nat White

Also present: Dr. Leah Bornstein, CCC President; Ms. Kellie Peterson, Legal Counsel; Ms. Jami Van Ess, Ms. Gayle Benton, Mr. Scott Talboom, Ms. Suzzanna Rodriguez, Dr. Russ Rothamer, Ms. Veronica Hipolito, Ms. Kimmi Grulke, Ms. Ofelia Gonzalez, Dr. Ingrid Lee, Dr. Monica Baker, Mr. Joe Traino, Mr. Michael Merica, Mr. Bob Voytek, Ms. Siri Mullaney, Mr. Mark Easton, Mr. Brian Harris, Mr. Don Johnson, Mr. Reuben Salazar, Mr. Paul Wilkins, Mr. Daniel Vigil, Mr. Dan Begay, Mr. Kevin Mullins, Ms. Ana Novak, Mr. Brian Harris, Ms. Barbara Seckinger, Ms. Pat Nelson, Mr. Don Johnson, Ms. Janis McMillan, Ms. Nina Webb, Ms. Patti Rusconi, Ms. Linda Barker, Ms. Jennifer Jameson, Mr. Paul Holbrook, Ms. Emily McRobbie, Mr. Dave Ramos, Ms. Ofelia Gonzalez, Ms. Jane Ward, Mr. Jim Hunter, and Ms. Joan White, CCC staff.

Reports, summaries, background material, and other documents referred to in these minutes can be found in the February 25, 2014 Documents File.

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds moved to approve the agenda and Ms. Patty Garcia seconded the motion. The agenda was approved as presented.

ADOPTION OF CONSENT AGENDA

Minutes of the Special Retreats on January 13 & 14, 2014

Minutes of the Regular Board Meeting and Work Session on January 28, 2014

Employment Separations/New Hires

Dr. Nat White moved to approve the Consent Agenda and Ms. Patty Garcia seconded the motion. The Consent Agenda was approved as presented.

INTRODUCTION OF GUESTS Mr. Scott Talboom

Mr. Talboom read the following names: Mr. Eric Pepin, Mr. Brian Greene, Ms. Marilou Neigh, Ms. Michelle McManimon, Ms. Katy Locke, Ms. Annette Zinky, and Mr. Richard Travis. Guests from the Page Campus: Ms. Denise Benally, Ms. Suzanne Green, Mr. Will Varnabo, Mr. Blake Pilker, Mr. Justin Regan, Ms. Louise Clark, and Ms. Jami Brough.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds received over 50 letters from Page residents expressing their concern about a possible closure of the Page Campus. He was still receiving letters via Email as he traveled from Page to Flagstaff this afternoon. Mr. Hammonds expressed his appreciation to the residents of the Page community, the Navajo Nation and others in the fifth district of Coconino County for taking the time to express their thoughts and concerns. First, Mr. Hammonds acknowledged Mayor William Diak of Page for the proclamation declaring February as Coconino Community College Appreciation Month. Mr. Hammonds continued by reading excerpts from each letter from the following people:

Julia Redman, student at the Page Campus
Mona Begay, Page student and employee of the National Park Service
Robin Scaramazzo, Dean of Students, Page High School
Cynthia Simpson, former CCC student and ASU graduate
Robert Talbott, Plant Manager at SRP
Vivian & Frank Firlein, retired couple in Greenhaven
Kim Larsen, former CCC student and ASU graduate
Geri Kilgariff, Page resident
Gevern Begay, resident of Bodaway/Gap
Craig Milan, Manager of the Page Walmart
Chris Pahissa-Van Meenen, Sales Associate, Gunsight Realty
Riley & Terri Barnes, Friendship Finance, Inc.
Teresa Adams, parent of future CCC students
Dorene Mudrow, Fredonia-Moccasin Unified School District
Val Gleave, former DGB member and Page resident
Bunny Cochran, Encompass Health Services
Carla Diamond, Branch Manager/Vice President, National Bank of Arizona
Jeff McIntyre, former CCC instructor and advisor, current counselor at Page High School
Julianne Hartzel, Flagstaff resident
Janet Brown, owner of Lake Powell Communications
William Justice, former Page mayor, Page school board member and current CAVIAT board member
Terry White, Page resident and parent
Jim Walker, Superintendent, Page Unified School District
Ruth Elinski, Executive Director, Coconino Coalition for Children and Youth
Pam Brown, Founder of the alternative school in Page
David Tennis, Page City Council member
Corey Albert, Part-time CCC instructor and Page High School teacher
Shelly Santana, Page Middle School teacher and CCC Remedial Reading instructor
Billie Wright, Lake Powell Communications
Judy Edwards, Page realtor
Emma Redman, CCC student
Janette Bunting, Page High School
Paul Worthen, Page resident
Angie Crim, Page resident
Kristi Gutierrez, business owner and Page resident
Jeanee Green, Page resident

Terry Bates, Page resident
Marilyn Cox, Fredonia resident
Kerry Kirkpatrick, Director, Web Marketing, Lake Powell Communications
Nancy Walker, Administrator at Page Unified School District
M. Doreen Ruth-Clark, Page resident
Jenny Foshay, former CCC student
Sara Peterson, Page resident
Ellena Gonzales, former CCC part-time instructor
Joanne Motko, parent and educator
Linda Butler, parent and Page resident

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Paul Holbrook, CCC instructor (Lone Tree), spoke in favor of keeping the ECE Program and education degrees.

Amber Poleveouma, potential CCC Nursing Program student for next year, asked the Board not to eliminate any of the Nursing Program.

Lena Fowler, Coconino County Supervisor for District 5, urged the Board to keep the Page Campus open as closing it would be devastating to the rural areas since the Page Campus is the only educational opportunity for these communities.

Debra Boone, parent and CCC graduate, credits the instructors at the Page Campus with helping her achieve her degree and urged the Board not to change the Page Campus.

Lenard Chee, Executive Director, Division for Community Development for the Navajo Nation
On behalf of President Ben Shelly and the Navajo Nation, Mr. Chee requested that the Board keep the Page Campus open as this area of Coconino County, particularly the reservation, really relies on this educational facility.

William Diak, Mayor of Page, urged the Board to keep the Page Campus open and not cut programs. He understands the challenges the Board faces but reminded them how very important CCC is to the northern portion of Coconino County.

Larry Clark, former police officer and fire chief, parent of four former CCC students, urged the Board to keep the Page Campus open and not forget how important this part of Coconino County is.

Jim Hunter, Director of the Page Campus and Interim Director of SBDC, expressed his appreciation and understanding of the difficult decisions the Board is facing and offered to be of help if at all possible.

Darren Redshirt, (iTV from Page Campus), closing Page would mean commuting to Flagstaff which would be a hardship. The Native American community depends on this Campus.

Shaun Deschene, (iTV from Page Campus), proponent of keeping the Page Campus open and considers the College to be an asset to the Page community.

Pam Brown, (iTV from Page Campus), retired educator, has observed both the growth and decline of services at the Page Campus over the years and doesn't see any reason to support declining services.

Dwight Largie, Executive Assistant to Navajo Nation Vice President Rex Lee Jim, strongly urged the Board to keep the Page Campus open for the well-being of the Navajo people as western education is highly valued.

Denise Benally, (iTV from Page Campus), urged the Board to keep the Page Campus open as it is accessible to her since she lives only three miles away.

Bernadett Begay, (iTV from Page Campus), requested that the Page Campus remain open as this Campus is the only educational opportunity for the people of this region. When students leave the area to obtain an education, they often do not come back.

Richard Travis, CCC Lobbyist, will report to the legislature the outcome of this meeting and that some very hard choices were made out of necessity. He commended the Board on the job they are doing.

Alan Maguire, homeowner in Flagstaff, complimented the Board and the College staff on the job they are doing. The College has a permanent ongoing mismatch between the budget and the funding levels which isn't going to stop. He felt that every option has been explored and everything the College does has value which makes the choices more difficult. He felt that the proposal the Board will vote on has a good balance of tuition and fee increases and program cuts. The Board's job is to preserve the essential core of this Community College so it can exist and grow and one day will prosper again.

Unrelated public comment by Mr. Alan Spiegler, educator: Mr. Spiegler distributed an information document to the Board regarding two issues: art equipment that he says was mistakenly disposed of and did not belong to the College and the conversion of the former photography darkroom into a ceramics work area.

Mr. Hurley said that the Board would direct the President to look into this matter.

ACTION ITEM

Discussion and possible action regarding the adoption of a Financial Austerity Plan –

Presented by Ms. Jami Van Ess

The District Governing Board is implementing a long-term financial austerity plan due to steep cuts in State Appropriations during the recession and the override that was not approved by Coconino County voters.

The College lost half of its State Appropriations or \$3 million beginning in Fiscal Year 2008/2009 when the recession began. In response, the College created a financial sustainability plan of both revenue and expense options to bridge the financial gap. Based upon that plan, the College increased tuition by an additional \$13 dollars per credit hour over three years to increase revenues by \$1 million. In addition, the College cut \$2 million in programs and services including 25 Full Time Equivalent positions.

In spite of these measures, the College continues to have a structural deficit which means that expenses outpace revenues from year to year. The gap between revenues and expenditures is nearly \$1.3 million dollars, or seven percent of the College's General Fund.

The District Governing Board continues to use the financial sustainability plan along with the following assumptions and principles in their decision making process:

Assumptions:

Sustainability of the College is priority

Continue to serve Coconino County district

Principles:

- CCC can no longer be everything to everyone
- Identify time and resources for College to solidify future
- Use data to make the best decisions for our students and community
- Take long-term vs. short-term view
- Communicate frequently and broadly to keep people informed
- Make decisions related to College mission
- Attempt to balance reductions/cuts with revenue generation

The financial austerity plan will eliminate the nearly \$1.3 million gap through increases in revenue and cuts/reductions beginning July 1, 2014. The cuts may include the elimination of 15 full-time positions or approximately 10 percent of the current full-time positions. The revenue and expense items recommended are as follows:

Revenue Items:

1. Increase standard tuition rate by \$2 per credit hour
2. Eliminate tuition plateau currently from 16 - 18 credit hours
3. Implement differential tuition rates to charge higher tuition to higher cost programs in place of fees
4. Implement a 2.75 percent credit card convenience fee to recover merchant charges
5. Implement a \$40 per credit hour "no show" fee for students who register, hold seats in class, and don't show
6. Increase Parking Fees by \$6 per year, from \$45 to \$51 per year
7. Implement a \$10 per year Employee Parking Fee

Expense Items:

1. Close the Page Campus or reduce to an instructional site
2. Reduce Nursing Program from 40 graduates per year to 20 graduates per year
3. Eliminate Dance Degree
4. Eliminate Early Childhood Education Certificate and Education Degree
5. Eliminate non-credit and corporate training programs
6. Eliminate SBDC (Small Business Development Center)
7. Eliminate selected vacant positions
8. Reorganize Academic Affairs to redistribute current department chair duties to deans, faculty, and two instructional coordinators
9. Change CCC tuition waiver benefit to tuition reimbursement with grade B or better

RECOMMENDED ACTION: That the District Governing Board approves a financial austerity plan and authorize the President to begin implementing the plan July 1, 2014.

Motion was made by Mr. Lloyd Hammonds to adopt the recommendation with the revision on number one of the Expense Items to read "Convert the Page Campus to an instructional site." Dr. Nat White seconded the motion.

Discussion: Mr. Hammonds directed his comments to the College staff: Mr. Hammonds said that a lot of comments were heard this evening from the Page community, the Navajo community surrounding Page and also through the many letters. He expressed his confidence that the staff will keep those thoughts in mind as a plan is developed to convert the Page Campus to an instructional site. People are very committed to what is currently being offered in Page and he hopes as much of this as possible is incorporated into the new plan.

Mr. Hurley said that none of these options are without serious ramifications for students and/or employees as well as the community. The College is in this position not due to financial negligence but due to a structural deficit in the extremely low property tax rate that has existed since the College was established 23 years ago. The defunding of community colleges by the State highlighted the devastatingly low County property tax support to the College and uncovered how severe the structural deficit is for CCC. The Board has spent many hours over the last few months scrutinizing the data and discussing the best course to take for the future of CCC. After examining the data and many scenarios, Mr. Hurley is confident that the Board has chosen the lesser of the two evils that were presented.

Dr. White said that the Board now needs to set a direction but that direction can change if future secure revenue sources appear at some point. All of the choices that are made tonight within this action item are things that can change in the future and he is optimistic that there will be increased revenues within the next couple years. Dr. White said that he understands the many comments that were made and appreciates them. It heartens him to hear the comments from Page and also from Flagstaff about CCC and how much education is cherished and especially the education received from this College. The Board feels the same way about CCC and the value of education.

Ms. Goodrum spoke as the newest member of the Board and that she was not mentally prepared for the difficult decisions that would need to be made. She also complimented the staff on the great job they have done and how difficult these last several months have been for them. She emphasized how extremely hard the decisions have been for the entire Board.

Ms. Garcia thanked everyone for attending the meeting, as well as those who spoke, those who wrote letters and all the people not present who were represented by others. It's very important for the Board to hear the voice of the community and it has been heard for quite some time. She emphasized that the decisions made by the Board were taken very seriously and with much consideration.

Mr. Hurley added a comment for the citizens of Coconino County in general, in Page and the Navajo Nation. He said that he has been a member of this Board for 14 years and has never seen the Board focus on Flagstaff. Nor has the Board ever lost sight of the fact that this College is Coconino County Community College and is the second largest county in the country. This Board has always strived to do the best for the students and citizens of the entire County and will continue to do this as this is the charge of this Board. This is what this Board has tried to do this evening. Mr. Hammonds suggested some time ago considering an alternative to closing the Page Campus and a lot of energy was invested in accomplishing this effort to keep Page viable. Both Mr. Hammonds and Dr. White have said that we can then build on this in the future. The same

holds true for the other programs that had to be cut. This Board’s focus is quite broad, it’s all inclusive, and does not function in a Flagstaff island.

Mr. Hurley called for a Roll Call vote on the motion.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds	Yes	Ms. Patty Garcia	Yes
Ms. Gioia Goodrum	Yes	Mr. Patrick Hurley	Yes
Dr. Nat White	Yes		

The motion was unanimously approved.

INFORMATION REPORTS

District Governing Board

AADGB Update – Mr. Lloyd Hammonds

A report will be presented at the March Board meeting as the AADGB meets on March 6th.

Alliance – Ms. Patricia Garcia

A report will be presented at the March Board meeting as the Policy Group meets on March 7th.

CCC Foundation – Ms. Gioia Goodrum

Ms. Goodrum reported that the Palette to Palate event is scheduled for April 25th from 5 – 8:00 pm and tickets are \$40 each or \$70 per couple. The committee is seeking art donations, restaurant participants and sponsors for the event. The potential donation of a piece of property is being discussed. Several board vacancies need to be filled. A grant of \$2,000 was recently received from BNSF Railway that will go towards the Detention Facility Re-entry program (collaboration between CCC, Goodwill and Coconino County Sheriff’s Office). The finance report indicates that the Foundation is on solid footing with approximately \$985,000 of assets and no liabilities.

Presentation for October 2014 ACCT Leadership Conference – Dr. Leah Bornstein

Dr. Bornstein reminded the Board members that previous discussion suggested the possibility of proposing a workshop for the ACCT 2014 Leadership Conference. Possible topics suggested were CCC’s Emergency Preparedness Plan that could be of interest on a national level. The other option is the Community Education Outreach project that was implemented over the last two years. If the Board is interested, Dr. Bornstein will be happy to help. Mr. Hurley asked the Board members to contact him if interested. Participation in these conferences is usually rotated among the Board members.

Business and Administrative Services – Ms. Jami Van Ess

Ms. Van Ess reported that the College is 58 percent through the year. The primary revenue sources indicate the following: Student Tuition and Fees are 87.6 percent collected compared to 89.8 percent at this same time last year. State Appropriations are at 75 percent, the same as this time last year. Property Taxes are at 63.1 percent collected compared to 63.9 percent at this same time last year. Under the expenses: Largest object is the Compensation and Benefits which indicates 52.5 percent, exactly the same as this time last year. Over all, we are trending pretty much as expected except that tuition is a little bit lower than projected.

Academic Affairs – Dr. Russ Rothamer

HLC Open Pathways Process – Dr. Rothamer reminded that CCC chose and was accepted to the

Open Pathway for maintaining its accreditation which is a ten year cycle (currently in year two) with the focus both on assurance and improvement. The assurance reviews take place in years four and ten through the HLC's electronic assurance system. Mr. Michael Merica, Director of Institutional Research and Assessment will be attending the Higher Learning Commission's conference in April and will be gathering information to finalize the remainder of our eight year plan. Part of that plan is a recommendation that CCC apply for the HLC Assessment Academy.

Preliminary Enrollment Report – Ms. Kimmi Grulke

Ms. Grulke, CCC Registrar, reported that tomorrow is the 45th Day of enrollment so the figures being reported today are as of day 21 and are unofficial. This comparison is between 2013 and 2014 Headcount. The total enrollment of Unduplicated Headcount is 3,541 compared to 3,744 in 2013 (down 5.4 percent). FTSE is 1,976 compared to 1,885 in 2013 (down 4.6 percent). Dual Enrollment FTSE is at 154 compared to 150 in 2013 (up 2.7 percent) and expected to increase.

President's Information Report – Dr. Leah Bornstein

Dr. Bornstein briefly touch on the status of HB 2340 which will probably go on a striker and then go over to and move through the Senate and come back to the House just as it did last year. Most of the focus at the legislature is on the budget, Child Protective Services and SB 1062. The Arizona Community College Coordinating Council is currently engaged in a director search.

Dr. White gave a brief update on the College's telescope. He has implemented computer control of the telescope through a software program and is pretty excited about the progress.

The Board directed Dr. Bornstein to look into the public comment item presented by Mr. Spiegler.

ANNOUNCEMENTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Next Board Meeting – March 25, 2014 at 4:00 p.m. at the Lone Tree Campus

Next Foundation Board Meeting – April 8, 2014 at 10:30 a.m. Lone Tree Board Room – Dr. White will attend in Ms. Goodrum's place.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion was made by Ms. Goodrum and seconded by Ms. Garcia to adjourn the meeting at 7:33 p.m.

MINUTES PREPARED BY:

Joan White
Board Recorder

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

Patricia Garcia
Vice Chair/Secretary of the Board

Patrick Hurley
Board Chair